

# ANNALI

di storia dell'esegesi

32/2  
2015

THE PASTORAL LETTERS

-----

EARLY CHRISTIANITY

EDB

# Contents

<i>Presentation / Presentazione</i> .....	281-283
---	---------

## **The Pastoral Epistles and Their Reception**

“The Pastoral Epistles and Their Reception” (ed. by Tobias Nicklas, Andreas Merkt & Joseph Verheyden). A “Vorwort” by Tobias Nicklas .....	285-286
--	---------

Michael Sommer, <i>Witwen in 1 Tim 5. Eine subkulturelle Annäherung aus der Perspektive der Schriften Israels und ihrer Auswirkungen auf das frühe Christentum</i> .....	287-307
--	---------

The main question of this essay focuses on the hermeneutics of scriptures in 1 Tim 5. I highly doubt that the regulations concerning widows in the Pastoral Epistles were made separately from Israel's traditions and their impact on early Christian texts. Quite the contrary, I'd like to argue that 1 Tim 5 knows very well the lively Christian debate about the role of scriptures which stood behind many texts that reflect the care for widows. First and second century texts use widows very often to allude to the book of Deuteronomy and its reception, in order to dispute its authority in various and different ways. The author of 1 Tim 5 leaves traces of this reception history in his text. By subtly pointing to the positions he wishes to overcome, he emphasizes his particular version of Christian identity.

Predrag Dragutinović, <i>Die Schrift im Dienst der gesunden Lehre. Text-pragmatische Erwägungen zu 2 Tim 3,14-17</i> .....	309-324
--	---------

This article offers a text-pragmatic analysis of 2 Tim 3:14–17. It shows that the author of 2 Tim does not plead for a theology based on the interpretation of scripture, but requires that every interpretation of scripture be done within the frame of tradition. On the other hand, the interpretation of scripture has to serve the “healthy teaching” of the Church. Thus, the author aims to deprive the opponents of their claim to adequately interpret scripture, while at the same time establishing an authoritative control of the praxis of interpretation.

Martin Meiser, <i>Timothy in Acts. Patristic Reception</i> .....	325-332
--	---------

How did ancient Christian authors interpret the texts concerning Timothy in Acts? They concentrated on Acts 16:1–3, a text implying historical and theological difficulties. In historical perspective the religious identity of Timothy and his parents is debated; both manuscripts and commentaries offer different opinions concerning the Jewish or non-Jewish identity of

Timothy's mother and of Timothy himself. The report of Timothy's circumcision in Acts 16:3, furthermore, raises problems in relation to Gal 2:4–5 and Gal 5:3. In light of 1 Cor 9:20 and 1 Cor 7:19 ("circumcision is nothing"), Paul's act can be justified as one of "accommodation" (*synkatabasis*) and "dispensation" (*oikonomia*).

David G. Hunter, "A Man of One Wife:"  
*Patristic Interpretations of 1 Timothy 3:2, 3:12,*  
*and Titus 1:6 and the Making of Christian Priesthood* ..... 333-352

The aim of this essay is to trace developments in the early Christian interpretation of the phrase "a man of one wife," which appears three times in the Pastoral Epistles. The article shows how the phrase became the basis for an understanding of ordained ministry as "priesthood," especially in Western Christianity. Widely interpreted to be a prohibition of the ordination of twice-married men (*digami*) to the clergy, the phrase "a man of one wife" gradually acquired "priestly" associations derived from the Hebrew scriptures. Originally articulated by Tertullian, using a biblical *agraphon* attributed to Leviticus ("*sacerdotes mei non plus nubent*"), and later connected to biblical restrictions on the wives of priests (Leviticus 21:7, 12–14), by the fifth century this "priestly" interpretation of the monogamy requirement became linked to the notions of the *sacramentum* of marriage (Augustine) and the union of Christ and the Church (Leo I).

Korinna Zamfir, *Women Teaching—Spiritually Washing*  
*the Feet of the Saints?*  
*The Early Christian Reception of 1 Timothy 2:11–12* ..... 353-379

The prohibition for women to teach (1 Tim 2:11–12) was widely received in early Christian writings. The passage was commonly read in conjunction with 1 Cor 14:34, forbidding women to speak in the *ekklesia*. After briefly recalling the text and its cultural context, I explore the interpretations of Origen, Chrysostom, Theodoret of Cyrus, Procopius of Gaza, Jerome, Gregory of Nazianzus and Ambrosiaster. Public teaching, commonly associated with authority, is reprehensible and shameful. A believing and wise woman may, however, teach her unbelieving husband. Women may, as a spiritual ministry, also teach women. In exceptional cases, competence and virtue allow women to teach other men as well, but in this circumstance they are expected to style themselves as students of men.

Tobias Nicklas, *Framing Paul? –*  
*Eine Diskussion mit Douglas Campbell* ..... 381-392

D.A. Campbell's book (*Framing Paul: An Epistolary Bibliography*, Grand Rapids–Cambridge: Eerdmans, 2014) raises fundamental questions for contemporary research on Paul. The book could bring relevant modifications for our vision, not only of the evolution of Paul's theology, but also of the history of early Christianity. For these reasons the book cannot be ignored or cast aside without answers. Its provocative propositions deserve a confrontation with a series of opposite questions. The article attempts to examine some of the main issues of the book and to encourage further discussion.

## Early Christianity

Sandra Hübenal, *A Possible New World. How the Possible*  
*Worlds Theory Can Enhance Understanding of Mark* ..... 393-414

A close examination of perspectives in the second gospel reveals that quite different gospels are proclaimed by Jesus and the narrating voice. With the help of *Possible Worlds Theory*, one

of the latest turns in narratology, it becomes clear that, when the character Jesus proclaims the kingdom of God to be at hand and invites other characters to make an existential decision to realize his possible world, it differs significantly from the world of the text and from the wishes and intentions of other characters and the narrating voice. The latter proclaims Jesus as the Son of God and orders recipients to organize their lives according to the implications of that belief—in other words, to make the world of the narrating voice a reality. The “gospel of Jesus Christ” is thus understood quite differently, depending on which agent within the narrative is asked about it. What does this mean for those who construct their identity based on the Gospel of Mark? A brief glance at the reception of Jesus, Mark and the βασιλεία in the Gospels of Matthew and Luke will shed further light on the question of how Jesus’ initial invitation into the kingdom of God is used by the Synoptics to provide models for Christian identity.

Luca Arcari, *Gesù come «(il) figlio dell’/d’uomo»*.  
 “Parole-azioni”, “veridizioni storiche” e “flussi  
 di trasmissione” tra l’Apocalisse di Giovanni e i sinottici.... 415-452

In this study, the author analyzes the development of the phrase “Son of Man” in early Christianity. He opposes a scholarly tradition which has analyzed the expression “Son of Man” primarily by focusing on the Synoptic Gospels, thus giving those gospels the implicit primacy of historical truth. Supported by a philological reading of the term “Son of Man”, the author, by means of an anthropological perspective, shows that in early Christianity a number of different trajectories of transmission were present. These varying trajectories interpret the title “Son of Man” in relation to Jesus in different ways, depending on the needs of different groups. The author presents, as a case in point, a reinterpretation of the Son of Man in Revelation: this work shows a way of interpreting the Son of Man, quite distinct from the canonical Gospels.

### Christian Historiography between II and III Century

Osvalda Andrei, *Il cristianesimo di Giulio Africano* ..... 453-484

The new editions of the *Chronographiai* and *Kestoi* of Julius Africanus (2007 and 2012) establish conditions for reframing the profile of this intellectual father of Christian historiography. Accordingly, it is appropriate to approach the problem of the Christianity expressed in the *Chronographiai*, not as a generic Christianity against the paganism of the *Kestoi*, but as a particular theology different from other Christian theologies. The analysis of some fragments shows an intense debate with gnosticism and its devaluation of the world below. In contrast to gnostic anti-cosmism, we could then define Africanus’ Christianity in the *Chronographiai* as philocosmic, because of his emphasis on solidarity between eons.

Giancarlo Rinaldi, *Bibbia, esegesi e politica:*  
*Dionigi d’Alessandria e l’imperatore Gallieno* ..... 485-507

Dionysius of Alexandria was one of the main exponents of Egyptian Christianity in the third century. We can read fragments of his work in Eusebius’ *Ecclesiastical History*. He lived in the troubled times of Valerian’s persecution, Gallienus’ peace and the military-political crises of the age. Dionysius was able to give meaning to these contemporary events, thanks to a typological exegesis of Scripture. He formulated a radical condemnation of Valerian as a eulogy to Gallienus, in which political events are interpreted in the light of biblical texts. This article tries to reconstruct the biblical and the pastoral activity of Dionysius in the context of the political affairs of the time.

## Modern Interpretation of Early Christianity

Anna Lisa Schino, *La fine del mito del «legislator»:  
la trasformazione delle figure di Mosè e di Cristo  
a metà del XVII secolo* ..... 509-524

The aim of this essay is to investigate Libertinism's interpretation of Moses and Jesus in the seventeenth century, as exemplified in Gabriel Naudé's works. Moses and Jesus are presented by Naudé as astute politicians and magicians. They took advantage of their knowledge of human society and the laws of nature to construct their religious charisma and political power. Religion is, according to Naudé, the best instrument for educating people and for building a solid basis for the government of a nation. By contrast, Thomas Hobbes dissociates the two religious figures and sees in Jesus only a spiritual, non-political leader. Hobbes no longer needs a political use for religion, since he locates the origin and legitimation of a sovereign's political power only in the social contract and the free assent of individuals.

Guglielmo Forni Rosa, *San Giovanni della Croce  
alla Società francese di Filosofia* ..... 525-546

In 1925, the discussion about mystical literature, which was already evident in French culture, became focused on the figure of St John of the Cross, following the publication of Jean Baruzi's seminal work, *Saint Jean de la Croix et le problème de l'expérience mystique* (1924). In particular, this emphasis emerged as a result of a meeting on the 2<sup>nd</sup> of May, 1925, at which Baruzi, Delacroix, Le Roy, Lenoir and Laberthonnière were present (Blondel also submitted a written contribution by mail). However, the discussion unfurled into a considerably wider context than this meeting for two reasons: neither Bergson nor Maritain was present (indeed, they were not even available as correspondents); also, reactions to Baruzi's book continued to be expressed throughout the twenties and thirties in both a philosophical and theological context (as seen in Chenu, Garrigou-Lagrange, and Gardeil). This essay gives attention to the key debates and some of the ways in which they may be resolved. The author also reflect upon the inherent points of marked divergences which separated the field of lay scholars from those (philosophers or theologians) whose aim it was to remain faithful to the teaching of the Church.

Emiliano Rubens Urciuoli, *Smetto (e ricomincio)  
quando voglio: la christianness intermittente dei seguaci  
di Gesù secondo Éric Rebillard*. Nota critica sul libro  
di É. Rebillard, *Les chrétiens de l'Antiquité tardive  
et leurs identités multiples  
(Afrique du Nord, 200-450 après J.-C.)*,  
Paris, Les Belles Lettres, 2014, 235 pp. .... 547-566

Éric Rebillard's *Les chrétiens de l'Antiquité tardive et leurs identités multiples (Afrique du Nord, 200-450 après J.-C.)* is a thin but noteworthy book. It is also a bold one: an intelligent dismantling of assumptions and positions that are taken for granted by traditional scholarship results from its refined methodology. Setting the stage in Carthage between the time of Tertullian and Augustine, Rebillard persuasively shows that "Christianness" was only one of a plurality of identities available to be activated in a given situation. Far from being a mere tribute to Rebillard's study, this paper intends to discuss and criticize its theoretical framework—Identity Theory—with reference to the question of how historically deep-rooted and structured relations of power create dispositions to act.

Éric Rebillard, *Un dialogue avec Emiliano Urciuoli*..... 566-568

**Book Reviews** ..... 569-575

Helmut Koester, *Da Gesù ai vangeli* ("Introduzione allo studio della Bibbia. Supplementi", 60), trad. it. di P. Lucca, Brescia, Paideia, 2014 (ed. or. *From Jesus to the Gospels: Interpreting the New Testament in Its Context*, Minneapolis, MN, Fortress Press, 2007) (Luigi Walt).

J. Brian Tucker and A. Baker Coleman, eds., *T&T Clark Handbook to Social Identity in the New Testament*, London, Bloomsbury, 2014 (Jonathan Bryant).

Andrea Nicolotti, *From the Mandylion of Edessa to the Shroud of Turin: The Metamorphosis and Manipulation of a Legend*, Leiden, Brill, 2011 (Najeeb Haddad).

**Books Received** ..... 576